

## Comparative Approaches Chart for ED11 -- Prof. Alan M. Weber

	<i>Traditional/Teacher Centered Education "Pushed-Down Curriculum"</i>	<i>The Montessori Method</i>	<i>The Free School Movement (of Open/Progressive Education)</i>	<i>The Bank Street/Developmental- Interactive Approach (of Open/Progressive Education)</i>
The teacher role	Instructor, authoritarian, formal, center of the learning process, very important	Directress, observer, guest, the neutral character of the adult, tool, limited, not meant to be very important	Laissez faire, non-disciplinarian, friend, nurturer, resource, limited, not very important	Facilitator, observer, role model, advocate, limit setter, creative, very important but not controlling
The classroom set-up	Facing teacher (rows of desks, cluster of tables, emphasized group area), teacher's desk, often assigned places	Prepared environment, realistic, attractive, well organized, work centers (inc. practical life, math, geography, sciences), child-centered	Open classroom, emphasis on freedom of movement and expression, gross motor activities, focus on outdoor and natural activity, "without walls"	Open classroom, emphasis on security and organization, creativity and imagination, dramatic play, blocks, language and art, child centered
The materials	Dittos and workbooks, academic, often abstract, teacher-directed, often closed-ended, memorized and performed	The Montessori materials, generally concrete, three phases, auto-educational, directed, closed ended use, uncorrected	Free, creative, often natural, open-ended	Open-ended, concrete, creative/imaginative, purposeful, often multicultural or teacher-made, explorative, teacher and child initiated
The curriculum	Focused on academics (3 R's), abstract, passive, teacher-centered, often rote, direct instruction, tested, generally whole group oriented, by grade level	Practical life to sensorial to academic, concrete until third phase, cognitive, math emphasis, active, individualistic, directed, work oriented	Incidental, spontaneous, free, active, holistic (emphasis on affective), concrete, play oriented, child-centered, natural, flexible, often unplanned	Holistic, balanced, integrated, around social studies, facilitated, planned and child-initiated and teachable moments, child-centered, process oriented, creative
The daily schedule	By subject or, in preschool, around "learning time," mostly sitting and attending times	Around Montessori work time	Spontaneous and flexible, around free play and outside times	Balanced, reliable, free play longest, group times as true group process
Age grouping	Horizontal, by chronological age	Vertical, "family style"	Often vertical	Generally horizontal, by developmental level
Cognitive vs. social-emotional priority	Cognitive (with true emphasis on academic aspect thereof)	Cognitive	Affective	Balanced
Individual vs. social balance	Contradictory: while focus is whole and ability group oriented and yet individualistic, both individuality and socialization are very limited; leaning more to group	Individualistic	Matter of choice, but learning to the individual since individual freedom of choice is not generally balanced by responsibility and group process	Balanced
Literacy development	Traditionally part to whole (phonics), centrally important	Generally part to whole, "explosion," not a central priority	Incidental and natural, whole to part, not a central priority	Whole to part (whole language), a central priority, "The language experience approach)
Role of imagination	Not a priority, often restricted to mind wandering	Not a priority, focus is on practical life and reality	A priority	A priority
Underlying philosophy	Authoritarianism, competition, principally environmentalism	Anti-authoritarianism and anti-competition, behaviorism in execution although intention was naturalism	Anti-authoritarianism, naturalism, psychoanalytic theory, social activism, progressivism	Progressivism, interactionism, leaning to naturalism, social activism, anti-competition, constructivist and psychosocial theory, DAP
Goals and priorities	Preparation for next level, passing tests, conformity, obedience, "learning" facts	Independence, competence, manners, getting a "head start" in skills and academics	Freedom, emotional health and development, creativity, individuality	Social skills, values, self-esteem, feelings, thinking skills, self-expression, creativity and imagination, balance
	<i>The High/Scope (formerly "Cognitively Oriented") Curriculum (of Open/Progressive Education)</i>	<i>The Reggio Emilia (Emergent Curriculum) Approach (of Open/Progressive Education)</i>	<i>DISTAR/Bereiter-Engelmann (Learning Theory)</i>	<i>Other approaches:</i>
The teacher role	Partner, active questioner, instructor vs. facilitator question subject to interpretation	Partner, co-teacher, co-planner, co-learner, researcher, provocateur, listener/observer, resource, advocate, nurturer, part of team w. atelieristi, pedagogisti & parents, loops	Model, reinforcer, center of attention, driller, instructor	<b>The Waldorf Approach:</b> The emphasis of Waldorf is the creative arts, natural development and spirituality. Teachers stay with their children from grade to grade. They cooperatively administer the school. Part of teacher training is their own spiritual/creative development, along with the study of "anthroposophy," a philosophy based on the works of Rudolf Steiner..
The classroom set-up	Open classroom, organized, flexible use, intellectually stimulating, child-centered, interest areas	Aesthetic, flexible, displays of projects in their process, atelier	One large room for routines and eating, three small rooms for three academic areas, bare walls, teacher centered	The day starts with a big lesson, often presented through oral stories, with the integration of dance ("eurythmy"), watercolor painting, modeling, singing, work in lesson books and "delayed academics."
The materials	Concrete, interesting, multifunctional, cognitively used, open-ended, planned and recalled thoughtfully, in partnership	Creative, symbolically expressive, open ended, used in both child-initiated and collaborative ways	Blackboard, worksheets, abstract, academic, teacher directed, closed ended, recited, reinforced	But since it is based on pseudo-science and Christian-biased spirituality, with questions regarding racism and cultishness, it is not included formally on the chart.
The curriculum	Active, concrete, based on key experiences, science and math, cognitively oriented, co-planned and assertively facilitated, doesn't really matter	Project method, the arts, "hundred languages of children," child initiated, emergent, negotiated, not predetermined ("no curriculum," per se), small group oriented, revisited, plan for possibilities, documentation	Academics, abstract, teacher centered, fast paced, heavy work load, reading (phonics), language (formal) and math (arithmetic), modeling > attention > repetition > reinforcement, passive, extrinsic, direct instruction, memorized, behaviorist	<b>The Creative Curriculum:</b> The Creative Curriculum is the curriculum derived from a popular curriculum book by Diane Trister Dodge. It has a strong foundation in holistic child development, and has good curriculum ideas consistent with DAP. The training is very popular and good for Head Start and child care professionals. But since it is really a book, one of whose objectives is sales, is not really "new," just basic DAP, and is a bit overly "packaged" as a curriculum, it is not included formally on the chart either.
The daily schedule	Plan-do-review, otherwise typical appropriate schedule	Time in atelier, long period of project work based on children's initiations and co-planning, time set aside for staff and parent meetings, flexible approach	Twenty minute rotating work periods, whole half day spent on academics, fast paced	
Age grouping	Often horizontal, probably insignificant	Horizontal, with mixed age opportunities, three years spent with same teachers (looping)	Small groups by ability, generally horizontal	
Cognitive vs. social-emotional priority	Cognitive, although recent attempt at more balance	Balanced	Cognitive (really only academic)	
Individual vs. social balance	Leaning slightly more to individual	Leaning toward social, small group and social constructivist oriented	Small ability groups, really neither social nor individual	
Literacy development	Whole to part, second priority after thinking	Whole to part, integrated whole language	Part to whole phonics, formal, divided, first priority, direct instruction	
Role of imagination	Very important, as part of cognitive process	Very important	No time, not a priority, really discouraged	
Underlying philosophy	Constructivism, interactionism, progressivism, social activism	Social constructivism, progressivism, art, social activism, psychosocial theory	Environmentalism/behaviorism	
Goals and priorities	Thinking skills, math concepts, science, a developmental "head start"	Self-expression, competence, creativity, community, social and cognitive development	Performance, an academic "head start," behavior modification, work habits	

